

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

In the Matter of Joint Application of Verizon Communications Inc. ("Verizon") and MCI, Inc. ("MCI") to Transfer Control of MCI's California Utility Subsidiaries to Verizon, Which Will Occur Indirectly as a Result of Verizon's Acquisition of MCI.

Application 05-04-020  
(Filed April 21, 2005)

**ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE'S RULING  
ON MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER**

The Utility Reform Network (TURN) moves for authority to file under seal the proprietary versions of the following documents:

*"Lawyers Only" proprietary Version of the Protest of The Utility Reform Network, Latino Issues Forum, Disability Rights Advocates, Consumers Union of U.S., Inc., Consumer Federation of America and The Greenlining Institute and Exhibit 1 thereto.*

The proprietary version of these documents contains information Verizon Communications Inc. and MCI, Inc. (collectively, Joint Applicants) allege is proprietary. TURN acquired this information under a nondisclosure and protective agreement entered into with Joint Applicants. Thus, TURN states, it is obligated to file this information under seal.

TURN states that granting this motion will not impair the rights of any other party provided that they enter into arrangements with Joint Applicants for access to a proprietary version of the protected information. TURN states that it will serve the proprietary version of its documents on any individual that

requests such a copy and that Joint Applicants confirm in writing is entitled to access this proprietary information.

Redacted versions of TURN's documents have been filed with the Commission and are available to the public.

There has been no opposition to this request.

TURN's motion states grounds for a protective order under Pub. Util. Code § 583 and General Order 66-C and authority there cited. The motion is unopposed. A public hearing on the motion is unnecessary.

Because a service list for this proceeding has not yet been posted, this ruling will be served by mail and electronically on all parties in the service list for Application 05-02-027, the merger application of SBC Communications Inc. and AT&T Corp.

Good cause appearing, **IT IS RULED** that:

1. The motion of The Utility Reform Network (TURN) for a protective order is granted to the extent set forth below.
2. The proprietary version of certain TURN documents shall remain under seal for a period of two years from the date of this ruling, and during that period shall not be made accessible or disclosed to anyone other than Commission staff except (1) on the further order or ruling of the Commission, the Assigned Commissioner, the assigned Administrative Law Judge (ALJ), or the ALJ then designated as Law and Motion Judge (which order shall only be entered after notice to TURN and an opportunity to be heard), or (2) upon execution of a nondisclosure agreement in a manner satisfactory to TURN. The documents so protected are:

*"Lawyers Only" proprietary Version of the Protest of The Utility Reform Network, Latino Issues Forum, Disability Rights Advocates, Consumers*

*Union of U.S., Inc., Consumer Federation of America and The Greenlining Institute and Exhibit 1 thereto.*

3. If TURN believes that further protection of this information is needed after two years, TURN may file a motion stating the justification for further withholding the information from public inspection, or for such other relief as the Commission rules may then provide. This motion shall be filed no later than 30 days before the expiration of this protective order.

Dated June 10, 2005, at San Francisco, California.

/s/ GLEN WALKER

---

Glen Walker  
Administrative Law Judge

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that I have by mail, and by electronic mail to the parties for whom an electronic mail address has been provided, this day served a true copy of the original attached Administrative Law Judge's Ruling on Motion for Protective Order on all parties of record in this proceeding or their attorneys of record on the Service List for Application 05-02-027.

Dated June 10, 2005, at San Francisco, California.

/s/ FANNIE SID

---

Fannie Sid

## **N O T I C E**

Parties should notify the Process Office, Public Utilities Commission, 505 Van Ness Avenue, Room 2000, San Francisco, CA 94102, of any change of address to insure that they continue to receive documents. You must indicate the proceeding number on the service list on which your name appears.